



## *Kitchen Cheat Sheet: Old Fashioned Buckeyes*

RESTLESSCHIPOTLE.COM | SOUTHERN COMFORT FOOD



### *Tips and Time Savers*

- Make sure your butter is softened to room temperature. Otherwise, you won't be able to cream it with the other ingredients.
- If your confectioners' sugar is clumpy, sift it before adding it to the peanut butter filling. Mix it in gradually, scraping the sides of the bowl often. This will make the buckeye filling taste extra smooth.
- You can use a handheld electric mixer or stand mixer to blend the peanut butter filling.
- Feel free to use a small cookie scoop to form the buckeye balls, so they're all the same size.
- Make sure no water gets into the chocolate while you are melting it. It will seize up in a hard ball and there's nothing you can do to fix it.
- You don't have to melt chocolate chips and candy melts in a double boiler. It'll melt just fine in the microwave as long as you do it in short intervals and stir often.
- Make sure you leave a small circle of peanut butter exposed—if you cover the entire ball with chocolate, they won't look like buckeyes!
- Let excess chocolate drip off the peanut butter balls before placing them on the lined cookie sheet so they look nice 'n neat.
- Sometimes I'll roll the bottoms in chopped peanuts or sprinkles just before the chocolate is completely set.
- Line baking sheets with waxed paper or parchment paper so the buckeye balls don't stick to the pans.
- Don't store buckeye candies at room temperature—warm peanut butter will separate from the chocolate coating!
- Make a double or triple batch of the peanut butter balls and keep them frozen. You'll be able to pull a few out and dip them at a moments notice!

### *Variations*

- You can substitute the dark chocolate chips with milk chocolate, semisweet chocolate chips, or bittersweet chocolate if you want your buckeyes to be sweeter.
- You can use all chocolate chips in place of the candy melts, but it will be a little harder to dip the peanut butter balls in the melted chocolate.
- If you don't have unsalted butter, feel free to use salted butter and omit the extra salt.
- You can use all granulated sugar instead of part brown sugar. I like the hint of caramel flavor that the brown sugar adds to the buckeyes, though.
- The coconut oil is optional since you only need it if your chocolate is too thick. Shortening will work in its place, too, if you have it.

## Storage

Refrigerate your buckeye candy in an airtight container for up to three weeks. I recommend separating each layer of buckeyes with a sheet of wax paper or parchment paper so they don't stick.

### **To freeze:**

Once the melted chocolate is set, freeze the buckeyes in a freezer-safe bag or sealed container for up to three months. Then, thaw frozen peanut butter buckeye balls in the fridge overnight before serving.

## FAQs

### **what kind of peanut butter works best?**

Use classic creamy peanut butter — the shelf-stable kind your mom bought in bulk. The natural kind with the oil on top will make the filling gritty, loose, and generally uncooperative, like a toddler with a cold.

### **can I use natural peanut butter?**

You can, the same way you can wallpaper a bathroom in August with no A/C. Technically possible, emotionally scarring. The texture won't be right.

### **why are my peanut butter balls crumbly?**

You added too much powdered sugar or didn't mix long enough. Add a spoonful of peanut butter and let the mixer work its magic until it's smooth like velvet.

### **why is the chocolate cracking?**

Your peanut butter balls were too cold when you dipped them. Let them sit out 5 minutes before dipping so the temperature difference doesn't cause chocolate tantrums.

### **can I use milk chocolate instead of dark?**

Absolutely — they'll just taste sweeter and more "church-lady bake sale." Use what your heart (and tastebuds) want.

### **why won't the chocolate stick?**

Your filling is too soft, or the chocolate is too hot. Chill the peanut butter balls longer and give the chocolate a moment to chill its attitude.

### **can I freeze buckeyes?**

Yes. They freeze beautifully for up to 3 months. Thaw in the fridge overnight so they don't sweat like a preacher in July.

### **how long do homemade buckeyes last?**

Up to 3 weeks in the fridge. Between you and me, you'll never see week three. They vanish.

### **can I make these ahead for gifting?**

Absolutely — these are the queens of make-ahead candy. Store them cold, layer with parchment, and they'll behave nicely until you package them up.

## *Nice to Have*

**As an Amazon Associate, I earn commission from qualifying purchases.**

If you're tired of wrestling with curled parchment like it's a possessed scroll, these 12x16 precut parchment sheets will save your sanity. They lie flat, behave themselves, and keep your buckeyes from gluing themselves to the pan like clingy exes. I keep a stack in the drawer because they're non-stick, they fit every sheet pan I own, and they make me look like the kind of woman who has her life together. **[Get it here](https://www.restlesschipotle.com/buckeyes/)**